



Agenda Item #6

Application 2024-58-CA

DETAILS

Location:

301 McDonald Avenue

Summary of Request:

Replace 4 windows on north elevation with vinyl windows not matching the originals in dimensions or light configuration.

Applicant (as applicable):

Rick Stojanik/ Quality Home Repair/Remodeling

Property Owner:

Patrick & Kelly McPhillips

Historic District:

Leinkauf

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The windows to be replaced are located on a street-facing elevation.
- The proposed new windows would not match the existing in light configuration, dimensions, or material, as required by the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History 2

Scope of Work 2

Applicable Standards 2

Staff Analysis 2

Attachments 3

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Leinkauf Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1987 under Criteria A and C for significant architecture and community planning; the district was expanded in 2009. The neighborhood was settled in the early 20th century as a streetcar suburb adjacent to Government Street and surrounding Leinkauf School (1904). Housing forms and styles in the district reflect the range of styles and forms popular from 1900 through 1955.

The two-story frame Colonial Revival style house at 301 McDonald Avenue was constructed in 1919. The house is depicted on the 1925 Sanborn map with its extant partial-width front porch and a partial-width rear porch that has since been enclosed as living space. The Sanborn map also shows a two-story frame garage near the center of the rear(east) property line; this structure appears to be extant.

Per the vertical files of the Historic Development Department, this property has appeared before the Architectural Review Board (ARB)once previously. The ARB approved the addition of a shed roof over the southern half of the east (rear) first floor elevation in August 1996.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Remove and replace four wood windows on the north elevation with vinyl sashes with a four-over-one light configuration.
 - a. The existing western pair of windows measure 24" wide by 40" high and would be replaced with windows measuring 24" wide by 36" high.
 - b. The existing eastern pair of windows measure 30" wide by 40" high and would be replaced by windows measuring 24" wide by 36" high.
2. Reside the northern elevation in kind.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*)

1. **5.4** Preserve original building materials.
 - Repair deteriorated building materials by patching, piecing-in, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing the materials.
 - Remove only those materials which are deteriorated and beyond reasonable repair.
2. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
 - Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
 - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
 - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
3. **5.21** When historic windows are not in a repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.
 - In instances where there is a request to replace a building's windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
 - Use any salvageable window components on a primary elevation.
4. **5.22**

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable. These often include:

- Wood sash

- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable. These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)

STAFF ANALYSIS

The property under review is a contributing structure located at the southeast corner of McDonald Avenue and Church Street in the Leinkauf Historic District. The application seeks approval of the removal of four (4) historic wood windows located on the first-story level on the north elevation, a street-facing side, with slightly shorter windows to accommodate new kitchen cabinetry and counters on the interior. One pertinent factor in the consideration of this application is that the windows to be removed are located on a secondary elevation, though they would be visible from the narrow, one-way western end of Church Street.

The two sets of windows proposed for replacement are slightly different in light pattern and size. The existing windows have a six-over-one light pattern, whereas the proposed replacements are four-over-one. The existing easternmost windows measure 30" wide by 40" high. The proposed replacement windows would be 4" shorter and 6" narrower. The windows would maintain the existing lintel height with shortening on the bottom. The westernmost pair of windows are 24" wide and 40" high; the replacement windows would be of identical width but 4" shorter. The lintel height also would be retained here, with the shortening on the bottom. In order for the new windows to blend into the elevation, the entire north elevation would be resided in kind.

The *Guidelines* instruct that historic materials should be removed and replaced only when they are beyond reasonable repair, which has not been shown to be the circumstance in this case. (5.4) The the *Guidelines* do not specifically address the presented circumstance, a proposal to replace the existing windows with shorter windows to accommodate new cabinetry and counters in a kitchen renovation. However, the *Guidelines* clearly state that when replacement windows are proposed, "the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration." (5.21) The proposed replacement windows would be in the same location, but they would not match the existing in light configuration. Furthermore, vinyl is considered an unacceptable window material for contributing properties within Mobile's historic districts. (5.22)

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER 6 DATE 10/16/2024
APPLICANT Quality Home Repair/Remodeling
PROJECT Replace 4 windows on north elevation with vinyl windows not matching the original openings



Site Photos – 301 McDnald Avenue



1. View east to front (west) elevation



2. View southeast to north (left) elevation; far western end of Church Street in foreground



3. View east-southeast to subject windows



4. North elevation; subject windows at 1st floor center



5. Detail: westernmost pair of windows proposed for replacement



6. example of proposed replacement window

301 McDonald Avenue, N elevation
windows to be replaced



301 McDonald Avenue, N elevation
windows to be replaced

