



Agenda Item #5

Application 2024-36-CA

DETAILS

Location:

102 Gilbert Street

Summary of Request:

Paint brick exterior. Replace all windows with aluminum-clad sashes.

Applicant (as applicable):

Tiffany Perkins, on behalf of 1818 Design, LLC

Property Owner:

1818 Design, LLC

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The subject property was constructed c. 1930, and the existing windows are replacements. The material and design of the original windows is unknown, though they likely were wood or steel multi-light sashes or casements.
- The proposed replacement of windows with windows that do not fit the original openings is not in conformance with the *Guidelines*, though the proposed window material is in conformance.
- The proposed painting of the exterior brick veneer is not in conformance with the *Guidelines*.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History 2
 Scope of Work 2
 Applicable Standards 2
 Staff Analysis 3
 Attachments 4

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The one-story brick English Cottage type house at 102 Gilbert Street was constructed ca. 1930. Based on Sanborn maps and historic aerial photos, it appears the footprint of the house stayed essentially the same from the date of its initial construction until some point between 1955 and 1967 (there is a gap in aerial photos). During that timeframe, an addition was made to the east elevation (rear) of the house.

This property has appeared once before the ARB. In 2022, an application to demolish the rear addition and construct a new addition came before the Board and was tabled.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Replace all windows.
 - The existing replacement windows would be replaced with aluminum clad, two-over-two windows fitting the existing, not original wood openings.
2. Paint exterior brick veneer and wood trim around windows.
 - Proposed paint colors include Benjamin Moore Swiss Coffee for the exterior body and Benjamin Moore Texas Leather for trim.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*)

1. **5.3** Preserve the key historic walls of a building.
 - Maintain significant historic façades in their original form.
 - Maintain historic façade elements.
2. **5.8** Preserve and repair original masonry materials.
 - Preserve masonry features that define the overall historic character, such as walls, cornices, pediments, steps and foundations.
 - Take particular care with historic masonry. Consult Staff for guidance when repairing and replacing mortar joints and masonry.
 - Unpainted 19th Century imported Philadelphia and locally manufactured brick may not be painted. In cases where historic brick has been previously painted, the paint color should be of a suitable color to match the age and architectural style of the structure.
3. **5.22** When a historic window is missing on a key character-defining wall, use a historically accurate replacement.
 - Historically accurate light patterns shall be employed. Use photographic, physical, and/or documentary evidence for the design.
 - A new window shall be installed in such a manner as to fit within the original window opening and match in depth and filling of the reveal. A reveal is the part of the side of a window opening that is between the outer surface of the wall and the window.
 - A doubled-paned or clad wood window may be considered as a replacement alternative only if the replacement matches the configuration, dimensions, and profiles of original windows.
 - For increased efficiency, storm windows can be installed. A storm window shall fit within the window reveal and avoid damaging window casings. Operable storm windows are encouraged.

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable. These often include:

- Wood sash
- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS

Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable. These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)

STAFF ANALYSIS

The property under review is considered contributing to the Old Dauphin Way historic district.

This application seeks approval to replace all existing windows. No original windows are extant in the original block of the house, and the application proposes the installation of aluminum clad two-over-two windows. The *Guidelines* instruct, “When a historic window is missing on a key character-defining wall, use a historically accurate replacement,” including “historically accurate light patterns.” Furthermore, “A new window shall be installed in such a manner as to fit within the original window opening and match in depth and filling of the reveal.” (5.22) The light pattern of the original windows is not known, but likely was multi-pane such as six-over-six or more or multi-light casement, to complement the English Cottage style. The existing replacement windows were installed at an unknown date and employed wood furring along the outer edges of the original openings to facilitate the installation of smaller windows. It should be noted, however, that the 1984 file photo shows correctly fitted windows in the front porch (west elevation). The application proposes the installation of new windows in the existing, non-original openings. While the proposed window material, aluminum-clad wood, is considered appropriate for Mobile’s historic districts, the *Guidelines* clearly state that new windows should fit the original window openings.

The application further proposes to paint the brick veneer and exterior trim of the historic house. Painting historic brick generally should not be undertaken as bricks need to “breathe,” and painting prevents them from doing so. Further, the bricks of the original block of this particular house are decorative in nature, as darker rows of bricks are located over the doors, in the window lintels, in the windowsills, and at the water table level. Painting the brick veneer of the historic house would not be in conformance with the *Guidelines*, which instruct to “maintain significant facades in their original form” and further state, “masonry features that define the overall historic character, such as walls, cornices, pediments, steps, or foundations” should be preserved. (5.3, 5.8) It should be noted, however, that the bricks used for the original structure and the addition vary in color and texture.

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER 5 DATE 7/17/2024

APPLICANT SSK Asset Management, LLC

PROJECT Paint brick exterior. Replace all windows with aluminum-clad sashes.



NTS

Site Photos – 102 Gilbert Street



1. View of west façade and north elevation



2. View of west façade and south elevation



3. North elevation



4. Detail: differing bricks on original (right) and addition (left)



5. Façade view. Note decorative brickwork above entry and at right



6. South elevation



7. Detail of existing replacement window and decorative brickwork.



8. View of rear elevation (later addition).