



Agenda Item #1

Application 2024-32-CA

DETAILS

Location:

156 S. Monterey Street

Summary of Request:

Replace windows on east (façade), north, and south elevations. Alter fenestration pattern on rear sunroom elevations.

Applicant (as applicable):

Krishna Jefcoat

Property Owner:

Same

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The replacement windows proposed for the façade are wood and would retain the existing three-over-one configuration.
- The replacement windows proposed for the north and south elevations are vinyl and would retain the three-over-one configuration.
- The fenestration alteration proposed for the casement windows in the sunroom includes reducing the number of casement windows along the rear elevation and installing two 8-lite fixed sash windows which match the size of an existing window on the same elevation.
- The proposed fenestration alterations for the rear elevation have not been finalized, as applicant seeks advice from the Board.
- Per the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*, vinyl windows are not acceptable.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History	2
Scope of Work	2
Applicable Standards	2
Staff Analysis	3
Attachments	4

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The property at 156 S. Monterey Street is a frame one-story Craftsman style bungalow with a gable roof and full-width front porch supported by four (4) battered columns resting on masonry plinths. Although the exact construction date is unknown, probate records show that the area was surveyed for subdivision in 1907. The extant house is represented on the 1925 Sanborn map as a rectangular form with a full-width front porch. There is a small one-story accessory structure represented on the southwest corner of the lot. The subsequent overlay from 1956 shows a new or enlarged two-story accessory structure which spans most of the width of the lot at its west end. Given this documentation and considering the stylistic evidence, a construction date of c. 1925 can be reasonably deduced. The residence currently comprises a rear sunroom that spans the rear of the house, which physical indications reveal is an addition. Further, the sunroom is not evidenced in the structure’s footprint on either the 1925 or 1956 Sanborn maps; therefore, the room was most likely added after 1956.

According to Historic Development Department records, this property has never appeared before the Architectural Review Board.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Replace all four windows on east façade.
Replacement windows would be wood, would fit existing openings, and would retain a three-over-one lite configuration.
2. Replace all windows on north and south elevations.
Replacement windows would be vinyl, would fit existing window openings, and would retain a three-over-one lite configuration.
3. Alter window pattern on rear sunroom elevations.
 - a. Remove sunroom windows on west end of the south elevation. Fill openings with wood lap siding to match the existing in size and profile.
 - b. The fenestration pattern on the west sunroom elevation (south end of the rear elevation) would be altered from seven (7) casement windows to three (3), with the replacement of the first three (3) windows from north to south, and the removal of the four southernmost windows.
 - c. Install two 18” wide by 36” high sixteen-lite fixed sash windows to the south of the three new (3) casement windows along the elevation. These windows would match the existing fixed sash window on the north end of the rear elevation.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*)

1. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
 - Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.
 - Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
 - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
2. **5.21** When historic windows are not in a repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.

- In instances where there is a request to replace a building's windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
- Use any salvageable window components on a primary elevation.

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable.

These often include:

- Wood sash
- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable.

These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)

STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property is a contributing structure in the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review proposes the replacement of all windows on the north, south, and west elevations. In addition, fenestration alterations are proposed for the north and west elevations of the rear sunroom.


In consideration of the proposed window replacement, the *Guidelines* direct to preserve and repair windows that are in repairable condition, and when they are not repairable, to match the replacement window to the original. (5.20) The applicant completed a window survey, assessing the condition of the windows intended for replacement. The survey and visual inspection reveal that the existing windows are not in a significantly deteriorated or unrepairable state. The proposed replacement windows for the façade would be wood and would retain the three-over-one lite configuration. The proposed replacement windows for the north and south elevations would be three-over-one vinyl windows, which is not an acceptable window material under the *Guidelines*. All replacement windows for the east façade, north and south elevations retain the existing three-over-one light configuration (5.21)

The existing rear sunroom is a later addition and not original to the house. The sunroom currently includes ten (10) casement windows, seven (7) along its west elevation and three (3) along its south elevation. The application proposes the removal of the three (3) casement windows on the south elevation. Wood lap siding, which matches the existing, would fill the opening. The proposed fenestration alterations to the sunroom's west elevation would include the replacement of the first three (3) casement windows (from north to south) and the removal of the subsequent four (4). Two (2) eight-lite fixed sash windows, measuring 18" wide by 36" high, would be installed in place of the removed casement windows. These two windows would match the one existing fixed sash located on the north end of the rear elevation. As stated above, the *Guidelines* call for preservation and repair of windows over replacement and removal. Although the sunroom is an addition, it is over fifty (50) years old and has attained significance in its own right. Also to be considered in review of this application is the rear location of the addition (with the west elevation not visible from the street). (5.20,5.21) The exact alteration and choice of materials have not been finalized for this portion of the project, as the applicant wishes to seek advice from the Board.

Site Location – 156 S. Monterey Street

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD VICINITY MAP



APPLICATION NUMBER <u>1</u> DATE <u>6/18/2024</u>	
APPLICANT <u>Krishna Jefcoat</u>	
PROJECT <u>Fenestration changes including a reduction in window openings on the west elevation and replacement of windows with vinyl sash</u>	

Site Photos – 156 S. Monterey Street



1. 156 S. Monterey, looking southwest.



2. East façade, looking west. The four façade windows would be replaced with new wood sashes.



3. View of north elevation, looking southwest. All side elevation windows would be replaced with vinyl sashes.



4. View of north elevation, looking southeast (note the evidence of a rear addition). All side elevation windows would be replaced with vinyl sashes.



5. View of south elevation, looking northeast. All side elevation windows would be replaced with vinyl (except 3 sunroom casement windows in foreground).



6. Detail of sunroom windows to be removed on south elevation.



7. View of west (rear) elevation, looking southeast.



8. View of eight-lite fixed on west elevation. This window would remain. The two new eight-light windows proposed for the south end of the rear elevation would match this window.