



Architectural Review Board Minutes

June 18, 2024 – 3:00 P.M.

ADMINISTRATIVE

The meeting was called to order by the Chair, Catarina Echols, at 3:00 pm.

1. Roll Call

Christine Dawson, Historic Development staff, called the roll as follows:

Members Present: Cartledge Blackwell, Catarina Echols, Karrie Maurin, Stephen McNair, and Barja Wilson

Members Absent: Abby Davis, Stephen Howle, Cameron Pfeiffer-Traylor, and Jennifer Roselius

Staff Members Present: Annie Allen, Kimberly Branch-Thomas, Christine Dawson, Marion McElroy, Bruce McGowin, and Meredith Wilson

2. Approval of Minutes from June 5, 2024

Prior to the motion to approve the minutes, Annie Allen, Historic Development Staff, addressed the Board to discuss an issue regarding a decision made on an application for 7 Hannon Avenue during the June 5th meeting. Ms. Allen proposed that the Board's decision to require a six-over-six window configuration for the replacement windows was not appropriate to the subject structure.

Stephen McNair agreed and made a motion to amend the decision on the application to state that the aluminum clad replacement windows would express a one-over-one configuration with space dividers to simulate a true divided light, and would fit existing window openings.

Karrie Maurin seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

Mr. McNair moved to approve the minutes from the June 5th, 2024 meeting.

The motion was seconded by Barja Wilson and approved unanimously.

3. Approval of Mid-Month COAs granted by Staff

Cart Blackwell moved to approve the mid-month COAs granted by Staff.

Mr. McNair seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimous

MID-MONTH APPROVALS

1. **Applicant:** Jordan Amstutz
Property Address: 1151 Caroline Avenue
Issue Date: 05/29/2024
Project: Reroof with shingles. Color: charcoal black
2. **Applicant:** All Weather Roofing and Construction LLC
Property Address: 20 Kenneth Street
Issue Date: 05/29/2024
Project: Remove asbestos roofing and replace it with shingles. Color: Colonial Slate.
3. **Applicant:** Olson Leavy
Property Address: 1802 Old Government Street
Issue Date: 05/29/2024
Project: Install 6' wood privacy fencing from northwest corner of property along north property line to east ROW line, then continue south to meet existing gate along Houston Street. Paint fence in Bellingrath Green.
4. **Applicant:** David Cooner Roofing Company
Property Address: 72 S. Lafayette Street
Issue Date: 05/31/2024
Project: In-kind repair to roof on small area in front and small area in rear, using existing shingles that have slid out of place.
5. **Applicant:** Johnathan Weitz
Property Address: 251 Government Street
Issue Date: 06/03/2024
Project:
 1. Apply gold paint to existing black iron galleries on the north and east elevations. The gold paint will be applied to each column and the baluster above each column. Color: PPG Gilded Gold (MTL 137)
 2. Install three (3) flagpole brackets, centered on the north balcony. Three flags will be inserted that will include a City of Mobile flag, U.S. flag, and 'The Admiral' flag.
6. **Applicant:** Roof Doctor of Alabama Inc.
Property Address: 261 Rapier Avenue
Issue Date: 06/04/2024
Project: Reroof in kind with shingles.
7. **Applicant:** All Weather Roofing & Construction LLC
Property Address: 1136 Montauk Avenue
Issue Date: 06/04/2024
Project: Reroof in kind with shingles in Colonial Slate color.
8. **Applicant:** Fortified Exteriors LLC
Property Address: 126 Macy Place
Issue Date: 06/07/2024
Project: Replace existing asbestos roofing with shingles. Color: Driftwood
9. **Applicant:** Bowmar Construction, LLC
Property Address: 261 Rapier Avenue
Issue Date: 06/07/2024

- Project:** 1. Repair and replace in-kind approx. 200sf- 300sf of wood lap siding on east elevation.
2. Repair and replace rotted exterior wood siding and/or trim where needed.
10. **Applicant:** David T. McConnell General Contractor
Property Address: 150 Government Street
Issue Date: 06/10/2024
Project: 1. Repair damaged brickwork and all windows on 3rd floor west elevation.
2. Repair and repaint porches on front (south) façade.
3. Replace non-original wood French door with fiberglass door to match existing in dimension and lite configuration.
4. Repaint as needed to match existing.

APPLICATIONS

1. 2024-32-CA

- Address:** 156 S. Monterey Street
Historic District: Old Dauphin Way
Applicant / Agent: Krishna Jefcoat
Project: Fenestration changes including a reduction in window openings on the west elevation and replacement of windows with vinyl sash

OTHER BUSINESS

1. The next ARB meeting will be held on **Wednesday, July 3, 2024**.
2. A Design Review Committee meeting-of-the-whole regarding proposed site layout at 900 Government Street will be conducted immediately following the June 18th ARB meeting. No public comment will be accepted.



Agenda Item #1

Certified Record 2024-32-CA

DETAILS

Location:

156 S. Monterey Street

Summary of Request:

Replace windows on east (façade), north, and south elevations. Alter fenestration pattern on rear sunroom elevations.

Applicant (as applicable):

Krishna Jefcoat

Property Owner:

Same

Historic District:

Old Dauphin Way

Classification:

Contributing

Summary of Analysis:

- The replacement windows proposed for the façade are wood and would retain the existing three-over-one configuration.
- The replacement windows proposed for the north and south elevations are vinyl and would retain the three-over-one configuration.
- The fenestration alteration proposed for the casement windows in the sunroom includes reducing the number of casement windows along the rear elevation and installing two 8-lite fixed sash windows which match the size of an existing window on the same elevation.
- The proposed fenestration alterations for the rear elevation have not been finalized, as applicant seeks advice from the Board.
- Per the *Design Review Guidelines for Mobile's Historic Districts*, vinyl windows are not acceptable.

Report Contents:

Property and Application History	2
Scope of Work	2
Applicable Standards	2
Staff Analysis	3
Attachments	4

PROPERTY AND APPLICATION HISTORY

Old Dauphin Way Historic District was initially listed in the National Register in 1984 under Criterion C for significant architecture and community planning. The district includes most nineteenth-century architectural styles and shows adaptations of middle-class domestic designs of the nineteenth century to the regional, Gulf Coast climate. It includes “fine examples of commercial, institutional, and religious structures as well as 20th-century apartments.”

The property at 156 S. Monterey Street is a frame one-story Craftsman style bungalow with a gable roof and full-width front porch supported by four (4) battered columns resting on masonry plinths. Although the exact construction date is unknown, probate records show that the area was surveyed for subdivision in 1907. The extant house is represented on the 1925 Sanborn map as a rectangular form with a full-width front porch. There is a small one-story accessory structure represented on the southwest corner of the lot. The subsequent overlay from 1956 shows a new or enlarged two-story accessory structure which spans most of the width of the lot at its west end. Given this documentation and considering the stylistic evidence, a construction date of c. 1925 can be reasonably deduced. The residence currently comprises a rear sunroom that spans the rear of the house, which physical indications reveal is an addition. Further, the sunroom is not evidenced in the structure’s footprint on either the 1925 or 1956 Sanborn maps; therefore, the room was most likely added after 1956.

According to Historic Development Department records, this property has never appeared before the Architectural Review Board.

SCOPE OF WORK

1. Replace all four windows on east façade.

Replacement windows would be wood, would fit existing openings, and would retain a three-over-one lite configuration.

2. Replace all windows on north and south elevations.

Replacement windows would be vinyl, would fit existing window openings, and would retain a three-over-one lite configuration.

3. Alter window pattern on rear sunroom elevations.

- a. Remove sunroom windows on west end of the south elevation. Fill openings with wood lap siding to match the existing in size and profile.
- b. The fenestration pattern on the west sunroom elevation (south end of the rear elevation) would be altered from seven (7) casement windows to three (3), with the replacement of the first three (3) windows from north to south, and the removal of the four southernmost windows.
- c. Install two 18” wide by 36” high sixteen-lite fixed sash windows to the south of the three new (3) casement windows along the elevation. These windows would match the existing fixed sash window on the north end of the rear elevation.

APPLICABLE STANDARDS (*Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts*)

1. **5.20** Preserve the functional historic and decorative features of a historic window.
 - Where historic (wooden or metal) windows are intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair them to match the existing as per location, light configuration, detail and material.

- Preserve historic window features, including the frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, sills, heads, jambs, moldings, operation, and groupings of windows.
 - Repair, rather than replace, frames and sashes, wherever possible.
 - For repair of window components, epoxies and related products may serve as effective solutions to material deterioration and operational malfunction.
2. **5.21** When historic windows are not in a repairable condition, match the replacement window design to the original.
- In instances where there is a request to replace a building's windows, the new windows shall match the existing as per location, framing, and light configuration.
 - Use any salvageable window components on a primary elevation.

ACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that are the same as the original, or that appear similar in texture, profile and finish to the original are acceptable.

These often include:

- Wood sash
- Steel, if original to structure
- Custom extruded aluminum
- Aluminum clad wood
- Windows approved by the National Park Service

UNACCEPTABLE WINDOW MATERIALS Materials that do not appear similar to the original in texture, profile and finish are unacceptable.

These often include:

- Vinyl
- Mill-finished aluminum
- Interior snap-in muntins (except when used in concert with exterior muntins and intervening dividers)

STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property is a contributing structure in the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review proposes the replacement of all windows on the north, south, and west elevations. In addition, fenestration alterations are proposed for the north and west elevations of the rear sunroom.

In consideration of the proposed window replacement, the *Guidelines* direct to preserve and repair windows that are in repairable condition, and when they are not repairable, to match the replacement window to the original. (5.20) The applicant completed a window survey, assessing the condition of the windows intended for replacement. The survey and visual inspection reveal that the existing windows are not in a significantly deteriorated or unrepairable state. The proposed replacement windows for the façade would be wood and would retain the three-over-one lite configuration. The proposed replacement windows for the north and south elevations would be three-over-one vinyl windows, which is not an acceptable window material under the *Guidelines*. All replacement windows for the east façade, north and south elevations retain the existing three-over-one light configuration (5.21)

The existing rear sunroom is a later addition and not original to the house. The sunroom currently includes ten (10) casement windows, seven (7) along its west elevation and three (3) along its south elevation. The application proposes the removal of the three (3) casement windows on the south elevation. Wood lap siding, which matches the existing, would fill the

opening. The proposed fenestration alterations to the sunroom's west elevation would include the replacement of the first three (3) casement windows (from north to south) and the removal of the subsequent four (4). Two (2) eight-lite fixed sash windows, measuring 18" wide by 36" high, would be installed in place of the removed casement windows. These two windows would match the one existing fixed sash located on the north end of the rear elevation. As stated above, the *Guidelines* call for preservation and repair of windows over replacement and removal. Although the sunroom is an addition, it is over fifty (50) years old and has attained significance in its own right. Also to be considered in review of this application is the rear location of the addition (with the west elevation not visible from the street). (5.20,5.21) The exact alteration and choice of materials have not been finalized for this portion of the project, as the applicant wishes to seek advice from the Board.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Ms. Krishna Jefcoat, the property owner, was present to discuss the application. she stated the façade windows would be replaced with wood sash replacement kits and explained that her contractor misinformed her that vinyl windows are acceptable in historic districts and has already ordered the replacement windows for the side elevations. She proposed a new plan to only replace the two most west windows on the north and south elevation, which are minimally visible from the street. In regard to the proposed fenestration alterations for the rear sunroom, Ms. Jefcoat provided a new rendering for the Board to consider.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Blackwell asked Staff if the sunroom was once an open rear porch.

Ms. Allen responded that it was.

Ms. Maurin asked the applicant if the replacement sashes for the front windows would be wood.

Ms. Jefcoat replied that they would.

Ms. Maurin asked the applicant to clarify the proposed fenestration alteration for the south elevation.

Ms. Jefcoat stated that all three sunroom windows would be removed, and the opening would be filled with lap siding to match existing; in addition, the west most window on the south elevation of the house would be replaced with a vinyl window that matches the original in configuration and size.

Ms. Maurin asked the applicant to pair the two proposed rear windows together as a double grouping.

Ms. Jefcoat was amenable.

Mr. Blackwell asked Staff if the quality of the proposed vinyl window was comparable to others that have been allowed in the district.

Ms. Allen stated that it was.

Mr. McNair asked when the sunroom was added.

Ms. Allen responded that a rear porch or sunroom is not represented on the 1956 Sanborn Map, so the alteration was made after that year.

FINDING FACTS

Mr. Blackwell moved that, based on the evidence presented in the application, the Board finds the facts in the Staff's report of the application, amended to include the use of vinyl replacement windows only on the rear portions of the north and south elevations and on rear elevation of the later addition, according to the submitted elevation drawing, with the exception that the two windows be paired to read as a double window. The remaining three-over-one side elevation windows will not be replaced.

Ms. Maurin seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Blackwell moved that, based on the facts approved by the Board, the application does not impair the architectural or historic character of the property or the district, and should be granted a COA.

Ms. Wilson seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:22 pm.

These minutes were approved by the ARB in their July 17, 2024 meeting.